

ANALYZE & EVALUATE CLAIMS

For use with "Should Supreme Court Justices Continue to Serve for Life?" on p. 22

Analyzing Authors' Claims

Read the debate about life tenure for Supreme Court justices on p. 22, then follow the directions below to analyze each author's claims and decide who makes a stronger case.

<p>AUTHOR: Neil Richards Professor of Law, Washington University in St. Louis</p>	<p>AUTHOR: Paul D. Carrington Professor Emeritus, Duke University School of Law</p>
<p>Author's main claim or argument in the debate:</p>	<p>Author's main claim or argument in the debate:</p>
<p>REASON 1: Name one reason the author gives for his claim.</p> <p>List evidence the author gives to support Reason 1.</p>	<p>REASON 1: Name one reason the author gives for his claim.</p> <p>List evidence the author gives to support Reason 1.</p>
<p>REASON 2: Name another reason the author presents.</p> <p>List evidence the author gives to support Reason 2.</p>	<p>REASON 2: Name another reason the author presents.</p> <p>List evidence the author gives to support Reason 2.</p>
<p>REASON 3: Name a third reason the author presents.</p> <p>List evidence the author gives to support Reason 3.</p>	<p>REASON 3: Name a third reason the author presents.</p> <p>List evidence the author gives to support Reason 3.</p>
<p>What persuasive devices does the author use?</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Appeals to emotions</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Uses data or scholarly research</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Tells why the other side's argument is weak</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____</p>	<p>What persuasive devices does the author use?</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Appeals to emotions</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Uses data or scholarly research</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Tells why the other side's argument is weak</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____</p>

EVALUATE: Which author do you think makes his case more effectively? Do you spot any weaknesses—like a bias or missing information—in either argument? Explain on a separate sheet of paper.